**Conference**

**‘Education, citizenship, and democratic personhood’**

**23-24 April 2012**

Erasmus Exchange Conference between the Department of Anthropology, Cambridge University and the Department of Education (DPU), Århus University

The aim of this conference is to exchange ways of conceptualizing and studying the education and formation of citizens and democratic persons. All participants take a wide approach to ‘education’. The Danish concept of ‘*dannelse’* refers to the formation of the person not only in educational institutions but in everyday life. Anthropological approaches to ‘personhood’ and ‘citizenship’ similarly encompass both formal and informal institutions and settings, often placing an emphasis upon the contradictory impulses that different educational processes engender.

The conference papers work together in two ways. First, the Danish contingent offers a contemporary diagnosis of changes to historical concepts concerning democracy and citizenship in Denmark. These papers study how this cluster of concepts is played out among ethnic Danes, minorities and educational migrants in ‘everyday life’, kindergartens, schools and higher education.

Second, the papers of the Cambridge contingent present ethnographies of education, citizenship and democratic personhood in vastly different political contexts – in Brazil, Kenya, Indonesia and Argentina – and these offer rich possibilities for comparative discussion with each other and with the Danish material.

To help focus discussion and comparison, participants are asked to have the following questions in mind throughout the conference, and these questions will be used to frame the final session:

1. What are the connections and differences between the concept of *dannelse* and anthropological notions of ‘personhood’ stemming from research in non-Danish societies? What are the implications of such a comparison for the attempt to develop more general theories of education and citizenship?
2. How can we conceptualise the relation between new visions of citizens or democratic persons and the kinds of futures, worlds or states they are educated for and meant to be participating in or creating? How can we construct anthropological comparisons between them?
3. How can we grasp the downsides of the seemingly positive language of democracy and citizenship? For example, what room for manoeuvre is there for persons (such as children or ethnic or religious minorities) within collectivities to which they do not choose to belong, and what forms of marginalization operate in the name of democratic inclusion? What forms of politics or activism (if any) should insights on these fronts engender?
4. How might the ambiguities of what is meant by ‘democracy’ and ‘citizenship’ present both challenges and opportunities for civic educators and those who have received a civic education?
5. Do we need different theoretical models to understand the process of civic education for, and political subjectivities of, young children, teenagers, and adults?

The programme is organised as follows. One introductory paper provides a provisional framework for conference papers to bat against. It raises questions (such as those above) about how to make anthropological comparisons between contemporary constructions of citizenship and democratic personhood which are not only constructed in different contexts, but are conceptualised as operating on scales ranging from the local to the global. A second introductory paper introduces contemporary shifts in historical concepts of citizenship and democracy in Denmark.

Sessions 3 to 6 each involve a Cambridge and a DPU paper. Each paper is treated individually – the presentation takes 20 minutes followed by 15 minutes for questions. The pairings are not quite haphazard, but if they yield common issues and themes that is a bonus. The end of each session has 20 minutes for discussion not only of the papers themselves, but for exploring connections and contrasts with previous papers and any emerging themes.

The participants are asked to keep the three above questions in mind throughout the conference for discussion in the final session. In that session, Bradley Levinson, a visiting professor at DPU from Indiana University, whose own research area is citizenship education in Mexico, will present his reflections on the conference. He will then chair a final discussion of the above focal questions. Each of the paper givers will have been allocated to one of the questions (above) at the start of the conference, to collect ideas from throughout the papers and the discussions and present them in this final session.

**Programme**

**Monday 23 April**

12.00-13.00 – Room D170 (glass hall)

**Lunch**

Welcome by *Anne Marie Pahuus, Pro-Dean for Research and Talent Development, Århus University*

Participants (or at least paper givers) introduce themselves

13.00-13.45 – Session 1: Room D170 (glass hall)

13.00-13.20 **Introduction: Connections and comparisons across sites and scales**

*Sue Wright, DPU, University of Aarhus*

13.20-13.45 Questions and discussion

14.00-14.45 – Session 2: Room D165

14.00-14.20 **Changing Conceptions of Citizenship in the Competition State**

*Søren Christensen & Jens Erik Kristensen, DPU, University of Aarhus*

14.20-14.45 Questions and discussion

14.45-15.00 **Break**

15.00-16.30 – Session 3: Room D165

15.00-15.20 **Education as a tool for democracy and post-democracy**

*Nick Long, University of Cambridge*

15.20-15.35 Questions

15.35-15.55 **Moulding civilized citizens in the children’s institutions of a welfare state.**

*Laura Gilliam and Eva Gulløv, DPU, Århus University*

15.55-16.10 Questions

16.10-16.30 **Discussion**

Walk through Copenhagen

Conference dinner in a restaurant in town

**Tuesday 24 April**

9.00-10.30 Session 4 - Room D165 all day

9.00-9.20 **Figuring the Student**

*Gritt Nielsen, DPU, Århus University*

9.20-9.35 Questions

9.35-9.55 **Education for Collective Citizenship**

*Sian Lazar, University of Cambridge*

9.55-10.10 Questions

10.10-10.30 **Discussion**

10.30-11.00 **Break**

11.00 -12.30 Session 5

11.00-11.20 **Culture, Knowledge and Pieces of Paper: A Case Study from Kenya**

*Henrietta Moore, University of Cambridge*

11.20-11.35 Questions

11.35-11.55 **The difference religion makes: Danish school classes, civil relatedness, and the obligation to participate**

*Sally Anderson, DPU, Aarhus University*

11.55-12.10 Questions

12.10-12.30 **Discussion**

12.30-14.00 **Lunch**

14.00-15.30 Session 6

14.00-14.20 **The ‘returns’ of educational migration: claiming citizenship in transnational contexts**

*Karen Valentin, DPU, Aarhus University*

14.20-14.35 Questions

14.35-14.55 **How to be Landless: Education and Democracy in rural Brazil**

*Alex Flynn, University of Cambridge*

14.55-15.10 Questions

15.10-15.30 **Discussion**

15.30-16.00 Break

16.00-17.00 Session 7 **Reflections in the light of the focus questions**

16.00-16.20 **Reflections**

*Bradley Levinson, Indiana University, visiting professor DPU*

16.20-17.00 **Discussion of the focus questions**

**End**

**Cambridge Papers and Presenters**

1. **How to be Landless: Education and Democracy in rural Brazil**

*Alex Flynn, PhD, ESRC Postdoctoral Research Fellow, Department of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge*

This paper centres its analysis on the Landless Workers’ Movement (MST) of Brazil and its programmes of education. These programmes, inspired by Paulo Freire, present alternative models of pedagogy but also include the use of *formação política* (political orientation) to guide MST members on the rudiments of MST citizenship values. This paper questions what kind of democratic personhood the MST’s programmes of education necessary foreground and thereby explores an altogether more important question: how can we understand the relationship between a radical social movement and ‘grassroots’ democracy in the first place?

**Dr Alex Flynn’s** research interests include cultural politics, contemporary art and its ‘value’, processes of transformation, and social movements, the last of which was the principal focus of his 2010 doctoral thesis on the Landless Workers’ Movement (MST) of Brazil.  His current research project focuses on the mass media and notions of radical protest. Recent publications include ‘Whiter shades of pale: “Colouring-in” Machado de Assis and race in contemporary Brazil’, recently accepted for publication to *Latin American Research Review*,and a co-authored article on engagement and academia, recently accepted to *HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory.*

1. **Education as a tool for democracy and post-democracy**

*Nick Long Ph.D, University of Cambridge*

This paper examines the changing and contested relations between education, citizenship and democratic personhood in post-authoritarian Indonesia. While pro-democracy activists see within education a potential to foster the critical spirit they consider essential for the public sphere, many Indonesians – especially in my fieldsite, the Riau Archipelago – see ‘critical spirit’ as invidious to Indonesia’s progress as a nation-state. They instead focus on the attainment of qualifications as a means of attesting to their ‘human resource quality’, and to render themselves effective components of the state through a sound understanding of ‘theory’. The paper will reveal how such an outlook undermines the critical potential of activities designed to foster forms of deliberative democracy, turning them instead into potent and empowering supports to what I argue should be theorised as a post-democratic imagination.

**Nick Long** is a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow in Social Anthropology at the University of Cambridge, where he is also a Junior Research Fellow at St Catharine’s College. He is the co-editor of Southeast Asian Perspectives on Power (2012, Routledge), and author of the monograph Being Malay in Indonesia (forthcoming, NUS/KITLV/University of Hawai’i Press).

1. **Culture, Knowledge and Pieces of Paper: A Case Study from Kenya**

*Prof Henrietta L. Moore, Ph., Department of Archaeology and Anthropology, University of Cambridge*

Female circumcision has long been a central aspect of initiation ceremonies for many communities in Kenya. As campaigns against ‘FGM’ have intensified over the last decade, some activist groups have introduced Alternative Rites of Passage or ‘cutting with words’ as a way to mark the transition to womanhood with a certificate rather than a cut. This paper explores how ARPs are perceived as a form of qualification and how this relates to changing concepts of education, citizenship, and achievement.

**Henrietta Moore** is the William Wyse Chair of Social Anthropology at the University of Cambridge. Her research programme has focused on gender, livelihood strategies, social transformation and symbolic systems. Her publications include *Still Life: Hopes, Desires and Satisfactions* (Polity, 2011); *The Subject of Anthropology: Gender, Symbolism and Psychoanalysis* (Polity, 2007); C*utting Down Trees: Gender, Nutrition and Change in the Northern Province of Zambia, 1890-1990* (Heinemann, 1994 – with M.A, Vaughan); and *Feminism and Anthropology* (1988; Cambridge University Press).

1. **Education for Collective Citizenship**

*Sian Lazar, PhD, University Lecturer in Social Anthropology, Division of Social Anthropology, University of Cambridge*

The paper is an initial foray into ethnographic material gathered in 2009 from participation in training programmes for new union delegates run by two public sector unions in Buenos Aires, Argentina. I explore questions of collective citizenship understood as in part the development of specific kinds of political subjectivities and understandings of agency and of the relationship between the individual and the politicised collectivity.

**Sian Lazar**: Research interests: ethnography of the state, democracy and citizenship; social movements, focussing on collective politics in El Alto, Bolivia and Buenos Aires, Argentina. Author of [El Alto, Rebel City: Self and Citizenship in Andean Bolivia](http://intranet.socanth.cam.ac.uk/sianlazar/elalto-rebelcity.html), Duke University Press 2008; an ethnography of citizenship that combines anthropological methods and theories with political philosophy, and several articles on politics, citizenship, trade unions and development in El Alto and Buenos Aires, including [‘Schooling and Critical Citizenship: Pedagogies of Political Agency in El Alto, Bolivia’](http://www.socanth.cam.ac.uk/onlinepublications/SML2010.pdf), in Anthropology and Education Quarterly 41(2), pp. 181-205. In Buenos Aires, Dr Lazar works with public sector trade unions, with an interest in the relationship between individual workers, trade unions and the state, examining the implications of that relationship for people’s political subjectivities and agency – their citizenship.

**DPU Papers and presenters**

1. **Moulding civilized citizens in the children’s institutions of a welfare state.**

*Laura Gilliam and Eva Gulløv, DPU, Århus University*

Based on fieldwork in Danish kindergartens and schools, this paper will give Norbert Elias’ concept of *civilizing processes* an analytic twist and look at the *civilizing projects* of childrearing institutions in Denmark. Kindergartens and schools both play a distinct role in moulding children’s behavior as well as shaping and disseminating certain ideas of proper sociality. Thus institutional ideals seem to be based on cultural ideals of civilized citizens and societies, yet the everyday life and the practical conditions of the child institutions also shape the ideal of the proper citizens – as the institutions both function as models of and models for the good society.

**Laura Gilliam**, Ph.d., Associate Professor at Department of Education, Aarhus University. Laura’s field of research lies at the cross roads of Educational Anthropology, Child Anthropology and ethnic minority studies. Her work encompasses children’s construction of identity, ethnicity and class, the socializing and integrative projects of schools and welfare states, as well as issues of resistance, gender, religion and social becoming. She has done fieldwork in Danish schools with pupils of various social and ethnic backgrounds, among children in Northern Ireland and among children displaced by civil war in Guinea Bissau, West Africa. Her publications include: *Civilizing Institutions. On Ideals and Distinctions in Upbringing* 2012, Aarhus University Press (with Gulløv, E – in Danish), *The impossible Children and the Decent Human Being. Identity, Troublemaking and Muslim Communities among Ethnic Minority Children* 2009 (in Danish), “Restricted Experiences in Conflict Society. The Local Lives of Belfast Children” 2005 (in Gulløv & Olwig (2005) *Children's Places: Cross-Cultural Perspectives* 2003, Routledge.

**Eva Gulløv**, Associate Professor in Anthropology, Department of Education, University of Aarhus, Denmark. For the last years, she and Laura Gilliam have worked intensely on a project entitled Civilising Institutions in a Modern Welfare State, resulting in the book *Civiliserende Institutioner* (Civilizing Institutions), Aarhus University Press (to be released 13. April 2012). Her work encompasses childhood, childcare institutions and methodology in ethnographic child research. Her publications, include “ Welfare and Self Care: Institutional Visions for a Good Life”, *Anthropology in Action,* 18, 3 (2011);“Kindergartens in Denmark” 2011, (Kjørholt & Qvortrup, *The Modern Child and the Flexible Labour Market: Exploring Early Childhood Education and Care*, Palgrave Macmillan; “Institutional Upbringing: A Discussion of the Politics of Childhood in Contemporary Denmark” 2008 (in James & James, *European Childhoods*); **“**Targeting immigrant children” 2008 (with Bundgaard, H ) (in N. Dyck  *Exploring Regimes of Discipline*. New York: Berghahn Books);. “Children of Different Categories” (with H. Bundgaard) in *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* , vol.32, January 2006 (nr. no.1); *Children's Places: Cross-Cultural Perspectives* 2003 (with K. F. Olwig), Routledge.

1. **Changing Conceptions of Citizenship in the Competition State**

*Søren Christensen & Jens Erik Kristensen, Department of Education (DPU), University of Aarhus*

The concept of citizenship (‘borger’) has two translations in Danish, one referring to the formal and juridical dimensions of citizenship (‘statsborger’) and another referring to the moral and the social-cultural sense of belonging and democratic participation (‘medborger’). In the last twenty years there has been an emphasis on the second meaning of citizenship in relation to the transformation of the welfare state and to the question of social cohesion. With the ongoing transformation of the welfare state into a national competition state in the wake of globalization a new sense of citizenship has evolved around the figure of the active and productive but also creative and innovative national employee (and consumer) whose citizenship virtue is related to national competitiveness in a globalizing knowledge and innovation economy. This paper presents a tentative diagnosis of (some of) these transformations.

**Søren Christensen**, Associate Professor at the Department of Education (DPU), Aarhus University. Research interests: psychoanalysis and cultural theory, the transformation of educational passions in East Asian education reforms, the concept of ‘the people’ in Western European right-wing populist movements. Recent publications in English include: ‘Cohesive Power and Competitive Power. Neo-Nationalism and Neo-Liberalism in Danish Globalization Strategies.’ In Johler, Reinhard et al. (Hrsg.) 2011, *Mobilitäten. Europa in Bewegung als Herausforderung kulturanalytischer Forschung*, Münster: Waxmann Verlag, pp. 275-282, ’Collective Identities and Popular Excesses. Laclau and Rancière on ’the People’ and ’Populism’. *Ethnologia Scandinavica. A Journal of Nordic Ethnology 2009,* ’World-Class Danishness. Culture as Competitiveness in Danish Globalization Strategies’. *Ethnologia Europaea* 38:2, 2008.

**Jens Erik Kristensen,** Ph.D. Associate Professor at the Department of Education (DPU), Aarhus University. Research areas: history of political, social and economic ideas, history of educational ideas and institutions, knowledge society, knowledge economy and politics of knowledge, social analytics and contemporary diagnosis. Recent research projects on social cohesion and competitiveness in the competition state, on the history of university ideas, on the history of the pedagogical profession and the ‘kindergarten’, and on globalization and figures of citizenship. Most recent publication: “Classical and New Ideas of a University in the light of Recent University Reforms and Performance Management” in Kristensen, J.E./Nørreklit H./Raffnsøe-Møller, M (ed.): University Performance Management – The Silent Revolution at Danish Universities, DJØF Publishing, Copenhagen 2011.

1. **The difference religion makes: Danish school classes, civil relatedness, and the obligation to participate**

*Sally Anderson, PhD, Aarhus University*

Danish school classes are premised on pedagogical understandings of civil personhood and democratic sociality that require of children and their parents a high degree of participation, not just in class discussion and school activities, but also in sociabilities beyond the bounds of school. Drawing on ethnographic work with Jewish, Christian and Muslim schoolchildren, this paper explores the troubled interface between civil moralities of universal participation and religious moralities of particularistic participation. It queries the understandings of children - both as civil and religious persons – that sustain the tension surrounding the civil incorporation of children from minority religious backgrounds.

**Sally Anderson** is Associate Professor at Aarhus University, Department of Education (DPU). Her work focuses on pedagogical doxa, civil relatedness and civil enculturation in a broad range of extra-domestic Danish sites: schools (private/public), sport associations, health projects and religious communities. Her publications include: *Civil sociality: Children, Sport and Cultural Policy in Denmark* (2008, Information Age Press); “Civil Sociality and Childhood Education” (2011, *A Companion to the Anthropology of Education,* eds. B*.* Levinson and M. Pollack, Wiley-Blackwell); “Going through the motions of ritual: Exploring the *as if* quality of religious sociality in faith-based schools” (2011, *Children and Religion: A Methods Handbook,* ed.S. B. Ridgely, NYU Press).

1. **Figuring the student**

*Gritt Nielsen, Assistant Professor, Department of Education (DPU), Aarhus University*

This paper focuses on students’ changing participation in the shaping of Danish society, the university and in their own education. It uses theories of figuration (e.g. Haraway, Braidotti) to discuss how ‘the student’, as a contested participatory figure, is negotiated and enacted in a period of extensive university reform in Denmark. The paper explores how different and conflicting student figures – like the co-citizen/co-owner, the consumer and the inquisitive or acquisitive learner – are enacted in particular moments of friction. It argues that co-produced with these student figures are also the ‘worlds’ that they are participating in, as ‘parts’ of often conflicting ‘wholes’.

**Gritt B. Nielsen,** PhD, Assistant Professor at Department of Education, Aarhus University. Her research interests: processes of internationalisation and marketisation within higher education, human capital thinking, new forms of student participation. Her Ph.D. focused on recent reforms of Danish universities and the changing notions of students. This built on previous research into contemporary negotiations over the concept of academic freedom. Her PhD was entitled *Student Figures in Friction* (2010) and recent publications include ‘Peopling policy: on conflicting subjectivities of fee-paying students’ in C. Shore, S. Wright & D. Però (eds) *Policy Worlds: Anthropology and the Analysis of Contemporary Power* (Oxford: Berghahn) and ‘Timing Students' Freedom. On paradoxes of efficiency and accountability’ in J. E. Kristensen, M. Raffnsøe-Møller & H. Nørreklit (eds) *University Performance Management* (Copenhagen: DJØF-forlag).

1. **The ‘returns’ of educational migration: claiming citizenship in transnational contexts**

*Karen Valentin, Associate Professor, Department of Education (DPU), Aarhus University*

Based on ongoing ethnographic fieldwork among Nepali students in Copenhagen this paper will explore the social, cultural and political motivations and engagements that lie behind decisions to migrate for education as well as to its expected outcome; especially how transnational educational migrants envision their contribution to democracy-building in post-conflict Nepal. Acknowledging that social remittances are not just circulated among individuals in their capacity as relatives and friends, but also as political actors, co-citizens and members of various civic organizations, the paper aims to explore the notion of social remittances in relation to an inclusive, actor-oriented understanding of citizenship, which emphasizes how people in transnational contexts claim membership in collective life through civic and political engagement.

**Karen Valentin** holds a Ph.D. in anthropology and is an Associate Professor at the Danish School of Education, Aarhus University. She has conducted research in Nepal, India, Vietnam and Denmark within the fields of education, migration, youth and planned development. Her publications include, among others the monography, *Schooled for the Future? Educational Policy and Everyday Life among Urban Squatters in Nepal* (Information Age Publishing, 2005) and contributions to *Youth and the City in the Global South* (Indiana University Press, 2007) edited by Karen Tranberg Hansen. She is currently the PI on a collaborative project “Education, mobility and citizenship. An anthropological study of educational migration to Denmark” (2010-2013) and part of another collaborative project “Nepal on the Move. Conflict, migration and stability” (2011-2015).

1. **Reflections**

**Bradley A. Levinson** is visiting professor at DPU, Århus University, and Professor of Education Policy Studies at Indiana University, where he also enjoys adjunct status in Anthropology and Latino Studies. From 2008-2011 he was Director of the Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies, and during that time he also served as the founding editor of the online Inter-American Journal of Education for Democracy. His work relevant to citizenship includes co-editing the 2007 book, Reimagining Civic Education:  How Diverse Societies Form Democratic Citizens*,* a 2005 article in Anthropology and Education Quarterly, “Citizenship, identity, democracy: Engaging the political in the anthropology of education,” a 2005 article in the Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies, “Programs for democratic citizenship education in Mexico’s Ministry of Education: Local appropriations of global cultural flows,” and his 2011 chapter, “Towards an anthropology of (democratic) citizenship education,” in The Blackwell Companion to the Anthropology of Education, which he co-edited with M. Pollock.